

9 DCCE2004/3938/F - PROPOSED DORMER WINDOWS IN LEAN-TO ROOF OF HOLIDAY LETS. CROSS KEYS INN, CROSS KEYS, HEREFORD, HEREFORDSHIRE, HR1 3NN**For: Mr. C. Corbin, per Mr. J.I. Hall, New Bungalow, Nunnington, Hereford, HR1 3NJ****Date Received: 10th November 2004****Ward: Hagley****Grid Ref: 55291, 44254****Expiry Date: 5th January 2005**

Local Member: Councillor R.M. Wilson

1. Site Description and Proposal

1.1 This application seeks permission for the introduction of two dormer windows into the lean-to roof of a converted rural building at Cross Keys Inn, Cross Keys. The building is located to the north of the Public house and sits at right angles to the adjacent highway. The building was previously a stable block converted into two holiday units by virtue of planning consent DCCE2002/1359/F. The two dormer openings are proposed in the northeast facing elevation and represent a revision to the extant permission for the conversion of this building in two units of tourist accommodation.

2. Policies

2.1 South Herefordshire District Local Plan:

GD1	-	General development criteria
C20	-	Protection of historic heritage
C36	-	Re-use and adaptation of rural buildings
SH23	-	Extensions to dwellings

2.2 Herefordshire Unitary Development Plan:

S1	-	Sustainable development
S2	-	Development requirements
S7	-	Natural and historic heritage
DR1	-	Design
HBA12	-	Re-use of traditional rural buildings
HBA13	-	Re-use of traditional rural buildings for residential purposes

2.3 Herefordshire SPG:

Re-Use and Adaptation of Traditional Rural Buildings

3. Planning History

3.1 DCCE2002/1359/F: Conversion of vacant outbuilding into bed and breakfast accommodation and holiday lets (2 units) - Approved

4. Consultation Summary

Statutory Consultations

4.1 None

Internal Council Advice

4.2 The Transportation Manager raised no objection to the proposed development

4.3 The Conservation Manager made no comment

5. Representations

5.1 Withington Parish Council raise no objection to this application.

5.2 A letter of representation has been received from the agent on behalf of the applicant making the following points in support of this proposal:

- The positions of the dormers *'could well have been entrances to the hay-loft'*;
- The re-roofing of the lean-to, and the advent of baled hay, could have resulted in the disposal of the loft openings;
- To re-instate the openings would overcome the internal problems;
- The associated Public house will cease to exist in five years if additional income is not secured;
- Pub is traditional and an asset to the local community.

5.3 Photographs were also submitted identifying dormer openings in the locality.

5.4 The full text of these letters can be inspected at Central Planning Services, Blueschool House, Blueschool Street, Hereford and prior to the Sub-Committee meeting.

6. Officer's Appraisal

6.1 Tourism related development is broadly supported by Herefordshire Councils development plan policies; however, national and local planning policy restricts much new build development in the open countryside, inclusive tourism accommodation. South Herefordshire District Local Plan policy TM5 states that:

'Proposals for...self-catering accommodation will normally be expected from the conversion or change of use of an existing property.'

South Herefordshire District Local Plan policies C36 specifies that when considering the conversion of an appropriate rural building, as is the case here, the proposal:

'...will retain the existing buildings qualities and essential features and respect local building styles and materials'.

Herefordshire Supplementary Planning Guidance: Re-use and Adaptation of Traditional Rural Buildings takes this stance further and states that:

'Applications that do not retain the existing character and traditional form of the building or preserve the important architectural or historical features will be resisted.'

Any building should retain its 'flavour' after conversion. If it does not then the primary aim of conserving the building is lost.'

One can therefore surmise from this that the conversion of an appropriate rural building into a new use is justifiable due to the intrinsic value of the building itself.

- 6.2 It is considered that the proposed dormer windows do not retain the remaining character and traditional form of this building; indeed it is considered that these dormer openings will be harmful it, as well as to the visual amenities of the locality due to their prominence. If development is permitted that harms the intrinsic value of a converted building, the value of its retention in the first place is lost. That being the case, the end result is no more appropriate or acceptable than flattening the building in question and erecting a new build structure in an open countryside location. Though these works are relatively minor in scale, it is nevertheless suggest that their impact will be great.
- 6.3 Turning to the other aspects of this proposal, no actual evidence that any openings were previously found in this building has been identified, however, it is recognised that stable buildings of this type could potentially, in their past, have had a hay loft entrance. That said, it is considered that any such opening would not take the domestic appearance or positioning of the proposed dormer openings or result in the creation of a residential appearance to the building, as is the case here.
- 6.4 The need for a first floor toilet and shower is, it is considered, questionable. This property has permission for a conversion that appears wholly acceptable internally and includes toilet and bathroom facilities on the ground floor, and a toilet on the first floor. It is considered unlikely that the lack of a shower at first floor level will impact significantly upon the marketability of these units.
- 6.5 The supporting information submitted with this application raises the issue of the viability of the associated Public House if additional income is not secured. Notwithstanding the fact that it is not considered that this should necessarily override planning policy, it is stressed that an extant permission exists for the perfectly viable conversion of this property into two units of tourist accommodation. The submitted photographs are of dwellings for which dormer windows are, in principle, acceptable and as such not appropriate for comparison with this proposal.
- 6.6 No concerns exist in relation to residential amenity issue or transportation.

RECOMMENDATION

That planning permission be refused on the grounds that:

- 1. The proposed dormer openings, by reason of their positioning, design and external appearance, would be out of keeping with the existing built form and will represent an incongruous feature that, if allowed, would have a detrimental impact upon the associated property. The proposal is therefore considered contrary to South Herefordshire District Local Plan policies GD1, C20, C36, and SH23, and Herefordshire Unitary Development Plan: S1, S2, S7, DR1, and HBA12, together with Herefordshire SPG: Re-Use and Adaptation of Traditional Rural Buildings.**

Decision:

Notes:

.....

Background Papers

Internal departmental consultation replies.